

Legal newsletter for the health and social services network and health-care professionals

lavery
Lawyers

EDUCATION: OBLIGATIONS OF PHYSICIANS PRACTISING IN A UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL CENTRE

CATHERINE PARISEAULT and SIMON GAGNÉ

IN A DECISION RENDERED ON APRIL 30, 2015,¹ THE ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL OF QUÉBEC (THE "ATQ") UPHELD A DECISION OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS OF A UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL CENTRE THAT REFUSED TO RENEW THE STATUS AND PRIVILEGES OF A PHYSICIAN WHO FAILED TO FULFILL THE OBLIGATIONS ASSOCIATED WITH THE ENJOYMENT OF THESE PRIVILEGES. FIRSTLY, IT SHOULD BE NOTED THAT THE APPLICANT'S CLINICAL COMPETENCE WAS NOT QUESTIONED IN THIS CASE. RATHER, IT WAS HIS BEHAVIOUR IN RELATION WITH TEACHING THAT WAS PROBLEMATIC.

In support of its decision, the board of directors of the hospital noted that the physician had breached his duty to provide supervision, guidance and availability to residents and external physicians to such an extent that the board had been forced to relieve him of his teaching duties and assign him to other functions. For several years prior to this, the physician had ceased to have the requisite skills and abilities to practise his profession in a university hospital centre, despite the institution's numerous attempts to intervene and rectify the situation.

The debate before the ATQ was centered on the interpretation of section 238, paragraph 4, of the *Act Respecting Health Services and Social Services*,² namely the "criteria of qualifications, scientific competence or conduct of the physician", with respect to "the specific requirements of the institution, and fulfilment of the obligations attached to the enjoyment of the privileges granted."

The ATQ decided that the decision not to renew the status and privileges was well founded and ought to be upheld given this physician's obvious lack of interest in teaching, which was an essential component of his duties. Such a lack

of interest was therefore found to be unacceptable considering the obligations associated with the enjoyment of the privileges of a physician practising in a university hospital centre.

In an attempt to have the hospital's decision annulled, the applicant alleged that the fact that his privileges had been renewed successively over the years showed that he must have been meeting the teaching requirements. However, the ATQ disagreed. Indeed, the evidence showed that, since 2006, despite the renewal of his privileges, this physician had received several notices from his superiors reminding him to fulfill his teaching obligations. According to the ATQ, these renewals of privileges ought rather to be seen as opportunities that were being afforded to the physician to remedy the shortcomings identified over the years.

In its decision, the ATQ noted that the physician had always been informed of the complaints made against him relating to teaching, but that he had chosen to ignore them and deny their merits, and had refused to act upon the

¹ *R.A. v. Centre Hospitalier A*, 2015 QCTAQ 041038.

² CQLR, c. S-4.2.

recommendations that were made to him, while visibly trying to blame others.

Thus, despite having been given numerous chances, the physician had shown very little improvement or interest, giving the institution no other option but to decline his status and privilege renewal.

In light of the evidence presented before the tribunal, particularly the contract of affiliation between the hospital centre and the university, it was clear that teaching was at the very heart of this institution's medical activities and was a distinctive requirement of this university hospital centre. In this context, the ATQ agreed that such an obligation could be attached to the enjoyment of a physician's status and privileges.

Paraphrasing of its holding in the *M.G. v. Centre Hospitalier A* case,³ the ATQ held that to reinstate the physician's privileges would be to restore him to a position in which it had been shown many times that he was incapable of fulfilling his teaching obligations because of his own choices.⁴

³ 2012 QCTAQ 031173.

⁴ *Id.*, par. 461.

CATHERINE PARISEAULT

514 878-5448
cpariseault@lavery.ca

SIMON GAGNÉ

514 877-2916
sgagne@lavery.ca

HEALTH LAW TEAM UNDER THE DIRECTION OF SYLVAIN POIRIER

PIERRE-L. BARIBEAU	514 877-2965	pbaribeau@lavery.ca
PIERRE BEAUDOIN	418 266-3068	pbeaudoin@lavery.ca
ANNE BÉLANGER	514 877-3091	abelanger@lavery.ca
JÉRÔME BÉLANGER	514 877-3012	jebelanger@lavery.ca
CLAUDIA BÉRUBÉ	819 346-3661	cberube@lavery.ca
DAVE BOUCHARD	819 346-3411	dabouchard@lavery.ca
JULES BRIÈRE	418 266-3093	jbriere@lavery.ca
GENEVIÈVE CHAMBERLAND	819 346-2562	gchamberland@lavery.ca
MAGALI COURNOYER-PROULX	514 877-2930	mproulx@lavery.ca
MARIKA COUTURE-HOULE	819 346-0340	mcouturehoule@lavery.ca
RAYMOND DORAY, AD. E.	514 877-2913	rdoray@lavery.ca
SIMON GAGNÉ	514 877-2916	sgagne@lavery.ca
DANIELLE GAUTHIER	819 346-8073	dgauthier@lavery.ca
HÉLÈNE GAUVIN	418 266-3053	hgauvin@lavery.ca
CHERYL GILBERT	819 346-2207	cgilbert@lavery.ca
RHONDA GRINTUCH	514 877-3068	rgrintuch@lavery.ca
MARIE-JOSÉE HÉTU	819 373-4274	mjhentu@lavery.ca
VÉRONIQUE IEZZONI	514 877-3003	viezzoni@lavery.ca
MARIE-HÉLÈNE JOLICOEUR	514 877-2955	mhjolicoeur@lavery.ca
MAUDE LAFORTUNE-BÉLAIR	514 877-3077	mlafortunebelair@lavery.ca
ARIANE LAUZIÈRE	819 373-1881	alauziere@lavery.ca
MYRIAM LAVALLÉE	819 373-0339	mlavallee@lavery.ca
JOHN N. MCFARLANE	613 233-2674	jmcfarlane@lavery.ca
ZEÏNEB MELLOULI	514 877-3056	zmellouli@lavery.ca
PATRICK A. MOLINARI, MSRC	514 877-3079	pmolinari@lavery.ca
VÉRONIQUE MORIN, CRIA	514 877-3082	vmorin@lavery.ca
JEAN-FRANÇOIS PAGÉ	819 346-7999	jfpag@lavery.ca
CATHERINE PARISEAULT	514 878-5448	cpariseault@lavery.ca
SYLVAIN POIRIER	514 877-2942	svoirier@lavery.ca
LOUIS ROCHETTE	418 266-3077	lrochette@lavery.ca
VIRGINIE SIMARD	514 877-2931	vsimard@lavery.ca
LOUIS THIBAUT-GERMAIN	418 266-3067	lthibaultgermain@lavery.ca
CHARLES OLIVIER THIBEAULT	514 877-3086	cothibeault@lavery.ca
CLAUDE VILLENEUVE	819 346-4117	cvilleneuve@lavery.ca

LAVERY, AN OVERVIEW

- ▶ In business since 1913
- ▶ More than 200 lawyers
- ▶ The largest independent law firm in Quebec
- ▶ World Services Group (WSG) a national and international network

▶ lavery.ca

CONTACTS

- MONTREAL** ▶ 1 Place Ville Marie 514 871-1522
- QUEBEC CITY** ▶ 925 Grande Allée West 418 688-5000
- SHERBROOKE** ▶ Cité du Parc, 95 Jacques-Cartier Blvd. South 819 346-5058
- TROIS-RIVIÈRES** ▶ 1500 Royale Street 819 373-7000
- OTTAWA** ▶ 360 Albert Street 613 594-4936

Pour recevoir notre bulletin en français, veuillez envoyer un courriel à info@lavery.ca.

All rights of reproduction reserved. This bulletin provides our clients with general comments on recent legal developments. The texts are not legal opinions. Readers should not act solely on the information contained herein.